Corporate retailers and the communities they serve

Community Incorporated
Community Incorporated

Jessica Rousseau
University of Detroit Mercy
School of Architecture
Masters Thesis
Prof. Noah Resnick
August 2013- May 2014
to people I like and find funny.
Contents

Abstract [1]

Thesis Introduction [3]

Case Studies [15]

Development Strategy [29]

Site Selection [59]

Final Design [77]

Conclusion [85]

Bibliography [87]

Image Citation [89]
Corporate retail has greatly expanded in the past 30 years with the introduction of the Big Box Store. While these chain stores brought many cities convenient retail options and cheap prices, they also left entire towns devastated after putting local mom and pop stores out of business. With a suburban and rural development strategy, corporate retail giants like Walmart and Target started to get a bad reputation for destroying small town and metropolitan communities. Due to a decrease in potential suburban development sites, coupled with the rise of urban population growth, these chains saw an opportunity to bring their large scale retail to dense urban areas. Beginning in 2010, corporations took the step towards urban development. Through the study of Walmart and Target it has become clear that while these urban locations are doing a much better job than their suburban counterparts of fitting within an existing context, they are still lacking in some core urban development areas, as well as neglecting to positively impact the communities they are inserting themselves into. This thesis explores the different ways in which a big box retail corporation can enhance their existing development strategy to better fit within an urban context, while also helping to boost their corporate image by positively impacting communities.
In this thesis the term **BIG BOX STORE** refers to a large scale retail chain that provides many different products under the same roof. Everything from groceries to clothing to sporting goods is sold by these mega retailers. The term **TYPICAL /TRADITIONAL BIG BOX DEVELOPMENT (SUBURBAN DEVELOPMENT)** refers to the original model of these big box retailers. They traditionally are large with little to no natural light, and are more times than not surrounded by a large amount of parking.

Traditional big box development helped contribute to suburban sprawl throughout the United States. As corporations searched for the cheapest land available, which was typically on the outskirts of town, local governments supported infrastructure changes to redirect traffic to the edges of cities. This spurred other development in the surrounding areas, and continued to stretch the boundaries of metropolitan areas. This corporate competition was the end of many mom and pop establishments in smaller towns. Once these small stores closed and the town was suffering the big box corporation would close it’s doors and search for a new city to open in. This has in turn left many vacant big box buildings throughout Metropolitan America.
abandoned big box hardware store

abandoned big box store with large rotting parking lot
As big box retailers’ corporate images began to suffer from this devastating development practice, people throughout the United States began to move back to the big cities. This gave large retailers not one, but two good reasons to finally develop in the previously untapped urban market.

In order to be successful in an urban market it is imperative that Walmart and Target’s urban insertions are not just a recreation of their suburban stores. The city brings many new challenges to the development process. Already developed downtowns typically have more strict policies on the types of structures that can be built. They also lack the land availability that a suburban location would have. This means a smaller footprint for both companies, as well as choosing between inserting into existing buildings or building a new structure.

To gain a better understanding of where an urban insertion of a big box store would be most successful it was essential to examine retail business models to get a better grasp on what exactly makes a big box store unique to the urban market.a

---

a.) Gibbs- Principals of Urban Retail Planning and Development
Corner Store

The corner store is the smallest business model. There are typically several of these 1,500-3,000 sq ft stores within a neighborhood as they serve about 1,000 households within a 1/4 mile radius.
The convenience center serves about 2,000 households in a 1-2 mile radius. It is typically a complex of small 1,000-2,000 sq ft shops. These usually have a variety of store types, and are seen as your typical strip mall.
The neighborhood center is nearly identical to the convenience center. The main difference being the pull of a medium-large grocery store. The complexes are around 50,000-70,000 sq ft with the majority of space being occupied by the grocery retailer. This model serves around 8,000 households in the same 1-2 mile radius.
While the previous three models are essential to retail throughout the United States, they do not fit within the big box structure. They only offer small scale variety retail options and since big box corporations are looking to provide many options under one roof, these models are better left for the companies already participating in this type of structure.

The next two retail models have the greatest opportunity for an urban big box store. While urban big box stores might not have the square footage to be a large anchor store their corporate identity can help to spur growth around the new location. A large corporation doesn’t need to be directly located at a corner or a public transportation stop because they have the pull of their national image on their side. People are willing to walk a block to go to store they recognize, and feel comfortable buying products from. While the patrons are walking they might be inclined to stop at a small shop on the way, creating the same type of system as the regional center.
The community center model is our current retail backbone. They are made up of big box anchors like Walmart and Target and have junior anchors such as Bed Bath & Beyond attached or nearby. The complexes are typically over 300,000 sq ft and serve on average 40,000 people living within a 4-6 mile radius.
The **regional center** is a typical mall model. Large anchor stores on the ends with junior anchors and small shops within a large interior space. The anchors are used to pull the customers through the mall and get them to notice the smaller shops. Until the 1950's downtowns were thought to be the regional center of the area. Families would plan entire day trips to the downtown shopping district to engage in all the activity created throughout the area. Large cities like New York and Chicago still have these areas today. They are looking to serve 15,000 people living within a 10-12 mile radius. This retail model is very large in scale and often times encompasses over 1,000,000 sq ft.
Because urban environments are more unpredictable than suburban environments the exact impact that these types of retail models can have on a community are hard to evaluate. While there has traditionally been a retail corridor in most major cities they were historically set up differently than the current retail practices and the way that major retailers today are utilizing the urban environment can not be defined in one of these retail models. While taking a closer look at the current urban locations of Walmart and Target it becomes clear that there is something missing in their urban development strategies.
Walmart and Target each took their own route when it came time to implement their urban strategies. Target launched the “City Target” branding campaign, which promised smaller more convenient stores to include “Innovation features for simpler shopping”. While a typical suburban Target is anywhere from 210,000 sq ft to 130,000 sq ft, City Target’s promised a foot print between 80,000 and 100,000 sq ft.

Walmart on the other hand launched 2 new developments. The Walmart Express model was to be around 12,000 sq ft, while the slightly larger Neighborhood Market was to be closer to 35,000 sq ft. Both of these models are smaller than the City Target model, and are substantially smaller than the 130,000-210,000 sq ft of the suburban locations.

This next section begins to compare and contrast these strategies in an attempt to gain a better understanding of the corporate development plan of each company.
Since the beginning of 2011, the Target Corporation has launched 5 City Target stores. They have 2 locations in Los Angeles, California, and one location in each of the following cities; Seattle, Washington, San Francisco, California, and Chicago, Illinois.

Up to this point all of their interventions have been within existing buildings in order to help them blend in more with the existing context. While the signage they have put on their stores is bold, they have for the most part been able to integrate it in a more urban fashion, than the typical suburban big box store.

While Target on one hand has the possibility of saving some money up front by inserting into an existing building, they also appear to be spending a little more to make sure that they are not negatively affecting the look of the community they are inserting themselves in.
City Target Branding - Seattle, Washington

City Target Branding - San Francisco, California
City Target- Chicago

The Chicago location takes on a different approach than the rest of the City Target locations. In order to be within a prominent location of the Chicago shopping district, this store was inserted into the former Carson Prairie Scott department store building. Designed by Louis Sullivan in 1899, it has one of Chicago’s most recognizable facades.

This however, means that the footprint of the existing building was actually quite a bit larger than many suburban Target stores. Seeing as though a part of their strategy was to become a smaller, more convenient store, this model stands out.

While parts of this building have great urban features to them, such as the picture windows throughout the first and second floor, there are other parts of the interior that feel much the same as a typical suburban location. Once you walk away from that prominent transparent corner, you are met with low drop ceilings and dark spaces, much like you would find in the suburbs.
The small scale Walmart Express locations seem to be lacking in the exterior urban development category. All of the current locations take on the feel of a small scale 1 story suburban development, plopped within blocks of 10-12 story urban neighborhoods.

Aside from the exterior facades these insertions are losing the big box store appeal. Because their sizes are so small they are more similar to a convenience store than a big box store. Entering into this category takes away the appeal of an untapped market, since there are already corporate retail convenience stores like CVS and Walgreens.

The Walmart Corporation also followed their suburban strategy with a couple of these locations. They built these small scale stores, kept them open for a year or 2, and upon completion of a Walmart Super center near by they closed the Express store, leaving behind yet another vacant building.
The Neighborhood Market is slightly more successful than the Express model. In many of their locations they have built smaller than suburban big boxes but bigger than Express boxes. Meaning, typical big box construction, shrunk down to fit on a smaller site.

They have however began to correct their development issues by starting to insert into existing buildings, as well as developing more towards the existing context.

Programmatically this model is also more successful than the Express model, but once again they are losing the big box appeal. The Neighborhood Market functions more as a grocery store than a one-stop shop. While this may be exactly what a community needs it still does not offer the product selection of a big box store, and is once again no longer inserting into an untapped market, as urban grocery stores exist in almost every city in America.
Walmart and Target’s urban development practices are drastically different from one another. While they both have positive and negative attributes to them, this thesis will be continuing forward with the more architecturally successful strategy that the Target corporation is implementing.
THESIS STATEMENT

BY USING URBAN DESIGN PRINCIPLES, BIG BOX CORPORATIONS CAN BETTER CHOOSE AN URBAN LOCATION BY DETERMINING WHICH COMMUNITY WILL BE THE MOST POSITIVELY AFFECTED BY THE INSERTION OF THE RETAIL CHAIN. THE SAME CORPORATIONS CAN ALSO UTILIZE ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN PRINCIPLES TO DESIGN A MORE FITTING BUILDING FOR THE COMMUNITY.
Development Strategy

In order to begin unveiling where an intervention could take place within Target’s already existing urban strategy, it has been broken down into three different parts.

**Location**: to help guide in the process of choosing a city to insert within

**Site**: to pinpoint the locations within a city that are in the most need of an urban retail development.

**Building Design**: to help choose an existing structure for the opening of a City Target.
As these criteria begin to overlap it was important to recognize which areas were the most important to the key groups of people involved in the development process and what roles they actually play throughout the process.

**Shareholders:** the people who own stock in the Target Corporation and are directly related to the financial success of the company.

WHAT IS MOST IMPORTANT TO THE SHAREHOLDERS: 1 (LEAST) - 5 (MOST)

**Community:** the people who are impacted the most by an insertion of retail development. Those who shop at, walk past, drive past, and live near the store.

WHAT IS MOST IMPORTANT TO THE COMMUNITY

**Architect:** the influence of key design and development decisions throughout every phase of the process.

WHAT CAN BE DETERMINED AND DESIGNED WITH URBAN AND ARCHITECTURAL PRINCIPLES
Location: Population Density

50,000 PEOPLE LIVING WITHIN 2 MILES OF A NEW CITY TARGET
Location: Foot Traffic

HIGH FOOT TRAFFIC AROUND THE CITY TARGET LOCATION. LOCATED NEAR OTHER HIGH FOOT TRAFFIC BUSINESSES.
Location: Vehicular Traffic

HIGH VEHICULAR TRAFFIC AROUND THE CITY TARGET LOCATION.
Location: Position on Block

THE POSITION ON THE BLOCK COULD BE THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN MAKING A PROFIT AND LOSING MONEY. MUST CHOOSE A LOCATION WITH THE BEST POSITION FOR THE SURROUNDING BLOCKS.
Site: Parking

PARKING SPECIFICALLY FOR STORE WITHIN A BLOCK.
Site: Public Transit

If parking is not adequate, a public transit stop should be located directly adjacent to the entrance of the store.
Site: Scale

Super Target

Regular Target

City Target

80,000-100,000 sq ft
Site: Technology

UTILIZE TECHNOLOGY TO MAKE THE SHOPPING EXPERIENCE BETTER FOR THE CUSTOMER.

Site: Branding

USE NEW CITY TARGET BRANDING TO EXPAND THE CORPORATE IMAGE INTO THE URBAN MARKET.
Site: Site Specific Merchandise

CONNECT WITH THE COMMUNITY BY PROVIDING MERCHANDISE SPECIFIC TO EACH CITY.

Site: Community Commitment

GIVE 5% OF SALES BACK TO THE COMMUNITY
Site: Delivery

UTILIZE EXISTING DELIVERY SYSTEMS FOR EXISTING RETAIL LOCATIONS FOR A QUICK AND EFFICIENT PROCESS.
Building Design: Existing Building

Utilize only existing buildings for city targets to help keep environmental impact low as well as the ability to blend in with existing streetscape.
Building Design: Windows & Signage

EVERY LOCATION SHOULD HAVE WINDOW DISPLAYS THAT ALLOW THE PEOPLE PASSING BY TO SEE INTO THE STORE. THE SIGNAGE SHOULD BE SMALL TO REDUCE CLUTTER ON THE BUILDING EXTERIOR AND ADD TO THE URBAN FEEL.

Building Design: Layout

CLEAR AND CONCISE FLOOR PLAN TO ALLOW FOR QUICK AND CONVENIENT SHOPPING. EACH LOCATION WITH BE ALTERED TO OFFER THE AREAS MOST DESIRED PRODUCTS.
Building Design: Materials

Utilize the existing materials for the exterior of the building with compatible signage material and other added material. Utilize some of the existing interior materials with the addition of standard metal shelving and drop ceiling.

[43]
Now that the framework for the City Target development strategy has been laid out it seems that the shareholders are not willing to sway from many of their core practices. This leaves the urban neighborhood they are inserting themselves into vulnerable to many of the same problems that suburban communities faced.

In order to find a way to meld the community and the corporation it is important to critique the implementation of this strategy and unfold a new strategy that will require some give and some take from both the shareholders and the community.

Because the new urban development strategy was derived from the existing strategy, it is set up in the same three parts: Location, Site, Building Design. While some areas needed to change drastically to fit within urban design principals, others were left the same to help keep the corporate image alive.
POPULATION CAPACITY IS MORE IMPORTANT TO THE SUCCESS OF A CITY TARGET. PEOPLE WOULD BE MORE INCLINED TO LIVE IN AN AREA WITH A DEPENDABLE STORE, SO HAVING THE ROOM FOR THE POPULATION TO GROW COULD BE BENEFICIAL TO THE LONG TERM SUCCESS OF THE LOCATION.

Satisfies a need for local residents. However, the lack of retail options could be a reason that the population in an area is low. Therefore, population density is not as important as population capacity - the space for more population to come.
URBAN CITIES THAT DON’T HAVE A TARGET WITHIN THE CITY LIMITS SHOULD BE THE FIRST CONSIDERED FOR A NEW LOCATION. HAVING RETAIL DIVERSITY HELP KEEP THE PRICES DOWN FOR EVERYDAY GOODS
Location: Foot and Vehicular Traffic

Having high foot traffic is important to the success of a retail location. In a city especially walk ability is very important. Having high vehicular traffic is important to the success of a retail location.

High foot and vehicular traffic near the city target location
Location: Position On Block

HAVING THE BEST POSITION ON THE BLOCK IS NOT NECESSARY TO THE SUCCESS OF A LARGE CHAIN SUCH AS TARGET. PEOPLE WILL GO TO THE STORE NO MATTER WHERE IT IS LOCATED ON THE BLOCK AND IT CAN HELP SPUR MORE BUSINESS FOR THE SMALLER STORES.

THE BEST POSITION ON THE BLOCK DOESN’T HAVE TO BE THE CORNER, PEOPLE WILL WALK TO A CITY TARGET EVEN IF IT IS IN THE MIDDLE OF THE BLOCK.
Site: Parking

If there is a number of parking lots and garages surrounding the location, store specific parking lots are not necessary.
Site: Public Transit

BEING LOCATED NEAR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS IMPORTANT FOR THE WALK ABILITY OF AN URBAN LOCATION. BUT WOULD BE BEST FOR THE COMMUNITY IF IT WERE LOCATED A BLOCK OR SO FROM A PUBLIC TRANSIT STOP IN ORDER TO SPUR GROWTH OF SMALLER BUSINESSES.

DOES NOT NEED TO BE ADJACENT TO A PUBLIC TRANSIT STOP. CUSTOMERS WILL WALK TO THE TARGET LOCATION WHICH WILL ALSO HELP SURROUNDING BUSINESSES
TARGET HAS GONE OVER THEIR PROJECTED SQUARE FOOTAGE IN EVERY LOCATION. THEY SHOULD MAKE THE URBAN LOCATIONS EVEN SMALLER THAN THIS PROJECTED AREA IN ORDER TO HELP STREAMLINE THE URBAN SHOPPING EXPERIENCE. THEY SHOULD ONLY BE PROVIDING PRODUCTS OF ABSOLUTE NECESSITY.

30,000-80,000 SQ FT.
Site: Technology

This is essential to the future of the Target company as more technology is used everyday for streamlining the shopping experience.

Site: Branding

Branding is important to the success of the City Target market because it will be the only identifying aspect for the consumer to be connected to the general Target experience.

Site: Branding

A good way to connect with the local customers, but the connection should be followed through more thoroughly.

Utilize technology to help make the smaller footprint a more usable experience for the shareholders and the shoppers.

Use new City Target branding to expand the corporate image into the urban market experience.

Connect with the community by providing merchandise specific to each city.
A large part of Target’s corporate identity and a good start to the connection between the corporation and the community should be taken a step further to help in more ways than just giving back money to various organizations and events.

Show community commitment by offering services for local residents along with the traditional form of community commitment.
Site: Delivery

THE OLD SYSTEMS MIGHT NOT ALWAYS BE THE MOST EFFICIENT.

DETERMINE WHAT IS THE MOST CURRENT DELIVERY METHOD THAT WOULD WORK BEST WHILE UTILIZING TECHNOLOGY TO HELP STREAMLINE THE PROCESS
Building Design: Existing Building & New Structure

A GOOD WAY TO FIT IN WITH THE COMMUNITY THEY ARE INSERTING THEMSELVES IN. THERE SHOULD BE A WAY TO DESIGN A CITY TARGET IN A NEW BUILDING THAT ALSO FITS IN WITH THE EXISTING URBAN FABRIC.

UTILIZE A COMBINATION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND NEW CONSTRUCTION TO CREATE A LARGE ENOUGH CITY TARGET LOCATION THAT STILL FITS WITHIN THE EXISTING URBAN CONTEXT
Building Design: Windows & Signage

Street Connection

GOOD IN THEORY BUT THEY DO NOT FOLLOW THROUGH WITH EITHER CRITERIA. THE MAJORITY OF THE CITY TARGET LOCATIONS DO NOT HAVE ANY WINDOWS AND STILL HAVE LARGE OVER THE TOP SIGNAGE.

HAVE A CONNECTION WITH THE STREET AND THE PEDESTRIANS. CAN BE REACHED BY PROVIDING PASS THROUGH ENTRIES, MULTIPLE ENTRANCES, WINDOW DISPLAYS AND URBAN SIGNAGE.
Building Design: Layout

**THE FLOOR PLANS SHOULD BE CONFIGURED BASED ON WHAT IS MOST DESIRED BY THE LOCAL RESIDENTS NOT THE OUT OF TOWN VISITORS WHICH IS THE WAY THEY HAVE SET UP THE CURRENT CITY TARGET LOCATIONS.**

THE FLOOR PLANS SHOULD BE CONFIGURED BASED ON WHAT IS MOST DESIRED BY THE LOCAL RESIDENTS NOT THE OUT OF TOWN VISITORS WHICH IS THE WAY THEY HAVE SET UP THE CURRENT CITY TARGET LOCATIONS.

USE COMMUNITY INPUT TO DETERMINE HOW THE LAYOUT SHOULD BE SET UP.
Utilize existing exterior materials and materiality of surrounding buildings to determine the material selections of the new store.
Site Selection

To implement this new urban development strategy it was imperative to begin with the selection of a city. Detroit Michigan fits every category of the new development strategy. There were originally three sites that were studied that were all located near the downtown area, but upon further investigation only one site was chosen to house the new City Target location. The site is located along Woodward Avenue, downtown’s main spine. The two buildings that were chosen along Woodward face the site where the Hudson’s building used to be (at one time the second largest department store in the world). The site then bridges the alley to the southwest and connects with Capital Park. A small park within the city that is surrounded by primarily vacant buildings, but is slowly become a hot spot for new residential development. The buildings that face capital park are a new 10 story building with 3 stories of retail and 7 stories of residential and an existing 3 story building that will be connected to the new building. There will also be a new construction alley bridge that connects Woodward to Capital Park.

The development strategy is broken down to further explain the selection of Detroit and the site that was chosen for insertion.
Population Capacity

PERSONS BY SQUARE MILE

- 3,801 - 6,000
- 6,001 - 8,500
- 8,501 - 14,871
WHILE THE POPULATION DENSITY OF DOWNTOWN DETROIT IS NOT THAT GREAT, THERE ARE PLENTY OF VACANT RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS THAT HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO BECOME FULL AS MORE PEOPLE MOVE TO THE CITY
Need for Retail Diversity

WALMART
TARGET
MEIJER
THE AVERAGE DETROITER MUST DRIVE OVER 11 MILES TO GET TO THE FIRST BIG BOX RETAIL LOCATION AND THE DOWNTOWN AREA IS EVEN WORSE AS THERE IS NO GROCERY STORE, HOME GOODS STORES, OR HARDWARE STORES WITHIN THE DOWNTOWN AREA.
Foot & Vehicular Traffic
MANY PEOPLE COMMUTE TO DETROIT EVERYDAY ON ONE OF THE MANY HIGHWAYS, THEY ALSO FILL THE DOWNTOWN AREA WITH HIGH FOOT AND VEHICULAR TRAFFIC
Parking
MANY SPOTS IN THE DOWNTOWN AREA HAVE MORE PARKING THAN BUILDINGS AND BECAUSE THERE ARE 6 STRUCTURES AND SURFACE LOTS WITHIN A 2 MINUTE WALKING DISTANCE OF THE CITY TARGET LOCATION THEY WILL NOT NEED TO ADD ANY MORE.
Public Transit

M-1 RAILWAY STOPS
PEOPLE MOVER STOPS
THE PEOPLE MOVER ALREADY HAS TWO STOPS WITHIN A FIVE MINUTE WALKING DISTANCE OF THE CITY TARGET BUT THE ADDITION OF THE M-1 RAILWAY WOULD ADD AN ADDITIONAL TWO STOPS

5 MINUTE WALK FROM PUBLIC TRANSIT STOP
Population Capacity
Typically the best position on the block is the corner lot but because Target is being used as an anchor store, people will walk to it even if it’s in the middle of the block giving the surrounding businesses some foot traffic.
Final Design

The existing buildings on Woodward are located in a historic district so changing the facades of the buildings is not allowed. The interior wall that separates the two buildings will be punctured so shoppers can freely walk from one to the other.

The bridge over the alley is raised up 14 feet in order to allow for delivery trucks to pass through. It is new construction and houses the vertical circulation between all floors of the buildings. It is made of glass curtain walls to also allow light to penetrate through to the interior of all the buildings.

The existing building in capital park has the exterior wall punctured through to connect to the new building. The facade is also changed to match the style of the retail portion of the new building. There is a patio for Target shoppers on the roof of this building that can be reached through the alley circulation tower.

The new building’s facade is broken up into two parts, one entrance for residents and one entrance to the Target. The 7 floors of residential are in an L shape to allow for a patio for residents.
New Construction:
3 floors retail
7 floors residential

Existing Building:
Use 2 floors for retail
The rest to remain residential

Existing Building:
Use all 4 floors for retail

Existing Building:
Use all 3 floors for retail

Alley:
New construction bridge connection
Floor Plans

21,000 sq ft

1st Floor- 0’

20,000 sq ft

1st Floor Over Pass- 14’
8,400 sq ft
4th Floor -46'
Sections
Conclusion

By using urban design principles, big box corporations can better choose an urban location by determining which community will be the most positively affected by the insertion of the retail chain. The same corporations can also utilize architectural design principles to design a more fitting building for the community. By thinking of the community members as shareholders and by both groups giving a little on their priorities, urban big box retail can positively influence a community.


Image Citations

All images are property of the author unless otherwise noted